

Town of Rockland

Planning Board

March 3rd, 2021

Page 1

Members present: Chairman Thomas Ellison, Vice Chairman Richard Barnhart, Ryan Edwards, John Veleber, Joseph Lambe, and Robert Ecker. Also, present, Glen Gabbard code enforcement officer, Patrick Hines of MHE engineering and Board Secretary Kaitlen Madison. Absent members: James Severing. Members of the Public: Edward & John Gorr, Linda Miller, Barbara & Lee Ellimouer, Rabbi Mosdos B'nei Zion, Randy Wasson of Wasson Engineering.

Public Hearing: Gorr Subdivision at 7:00pm

The public hearing was opened at 7:00pm at 95 Main street Livingston Manor, NY 12758 and opened on a Zoom video call to the public. No public comments were made. Chairman Thomas Ellison asked for a motion to close the public hearing. The motion was made by Vice Chairman Richard Barnhart and seconded by Ryan Edwards. The motion carried 5-0.

Chairman Ellison opened the Planning board meeting with the Pledge of the Allegiance to the flag. Chairman Thomas Ellison made a motion to approve the February minutes. The motion was approved by Vice Chairman Richard Barnhart, Seconded by Ryan Edwards. The motion carried 5-0.

Gorr Subdivision

The board members requested 3 signed copies of the final subdivision maps and engineering maps. A motion to approve the Gorr subdivision was made by Richard Barnhart and seconded by Ryan Edwards. Motion carried 6-0.

W.W Kocher – special use permit

Chairman Thomas Ellison made a motion to formally deny the application of the special use permit for the W.W Kocher and submit it to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a Variance. The issue arises due to a set back with the lot line with Bald mountain LLC. The motion was approved by John Veleber and seconded by Richard Barnhart. the motion carried 6-0.

Public Hearing: Camp Na'Aleh at 7:15pm

The Public hearing was open by Chairman Thomas Ellison with introduction of site engineer Randy Wassom and camp operator Rabbi Mosdos B'nei Zion. Camp Na'aleh is a summer camp for girls, the proposal is an expansion of the camp which would include two (2) addition dormitory units and two (2) additional staff dormitory units. Site plans have been reviewed by Department of Conservation, Department of Health, Code enforcement and the Town of Rockland Planning Board for environmental review, site line approval, water & sewer, and issues of trespassing. The public hearing was open to Public Comment, as follows:

Town of Rockland

Planning Board

March 3rd, 2021

Page 2

Camp Na'Aleh Public hearing Comments:

Attending by zoom video: Claire & Gary Taggart, Elena Goyance, Zintis Muinzits, Art Reigal (Chairman ZBA), Diane Beveridge, Amy & Jeff Brightfield, Sarah Von Hoven, Everardo Goyances, Robin Levy, Eric Von Hoven ,Dane Von Hoven and Ester Goyances ,Delaware Highlands conservation Nicole DeCarolis

- Barbara & Lee Ellimouer: concerns of trespassing, noise complaints
- Sarah Von Hoven: time schedule of construction, noise complaints – construction, emergency speakers / illegal use, loud campers, issues with blockage of the agreed upon road entrance / an easement, traffic due to increased population, concerns for wildlife & conservation, light pollution for sign lighting, public health concern due to a lack of mask wearing during summer of 2020
- Diane Sprague: traffic & pollution complaint, concern of public health due to a lack of mask wearing by campers in summer of 2020, noise complaint, wildlife concern – increase in bears
- Elena Goyanes: noise complaint, trespassing
- Jeff Brightfield: noise complaint, issue with emergency speakers, wildlife concerns – increase in bears
- Diane Beveridge: noise complaints, trespassing, the feeding of farm animals, traffic, speeding and road blockage issues
- Linda Miller: Noise complaint, trespassing
- Claire & Gary Taggart: trespassing, garbage issue, wildlife concerns – increase in bears, issues with blockage of the agreed upon road entrance / easement, traffic due to increased population, public health concern due to a lack of mask wearing during summer of 2020.

Letters submitted to public hearing by

- Rocco Mesiti – noise complaint
- Joseph & Alicia Allard – noise complaint
- Diane Sprague - public health concern due to a lack of mask wearing during summer of 2020
- Sarah Von Hoven - repeatedly trespass, vandalize and litter my property , , issues with blockage of the agreed upon road entrance / an easement, logging issue

Chairman Thomas Ellison made a motion to close the Public hearing at 8:15pm, The motion was approved by John Veleber and seconded by Richard Barnhart, Motion carried 6-0.

Town of Rockland

Planning Board

March 3rd, 2021

Page 3

Camp Na'Aleh – Special Use Permit

Chairman Thomas Ellison reopened the Planning board meeting with the review of the public comments given on the Camp Na'aleh special use permit with Camp owner and Director Rabbi Mosdos B'nei Zion, and Randy Wassom of Wassom Engineering.

The proposed fence and trail cameras previously discussed would be used to keep the garbage on the property and help deter trespassing, and graffiti by the campers. Trail cameras can be used as a deterrent according to Code enforcement Officer Glen Gabbard and MHE engineer Patrick Hines. In addition to the noise complaints, the use of the speaker system outside of emergency use only must be looked into and have to have some form of repercussion if used outside of the intended use. The Board discussed the town noise ordinance with the code enforcement officer.

Further complaints were touched upon about the increased sightings in bears in and around the properties, due to the amount of garbage and possible lack of sanitation on the property. Rabbi B'nei Zion said that there is two (2) maintenance staff, and the campers are responsible for cleaning up after themselves in most cases.

Rabbi Mosdos B'nei Zion was questioned about the use of the gate and security guard on the property. The gate is closed from Friday starting at sundown and reopened on Saturday night only during the months of July and August to adhere to Jewish law of Shabbat. The Guard is to keep uninvited parents away from the children during camp operation. The issue of denied access of the entry road with the easement agreement due to a closed gate and security guard was founded to be a violation of the agreement. A consensus was found that the gate must be removed.

The issue of increased traffic and air pollution due to busses idling on Parkston Road and DeBruce road was brought up by Vice Chairman Richard Barnhart. Rabbi B'nei Zion spoke about different camps coming to participate in different sporting events through out the course of the summer camp program. Kids do not stay over night and the increased number of kids is only for 2 hours maximum. The number of buses vary from 2-5 buses. Camp regulations dictate the campers are not to leave the campgrounds , so buses could not be left on the road which is outside the campgrounds.

Further review of the overall site and engineering plan will be done by Patrick Hines of MHE engineering, with comment letter to follow. The Planning board will contact Town of Rockland Attorney Ken Klein to put together a letter to be submitted with review of the special use permit application.

A ten (10) day period starting from March 3rd, 2021 will be left open for further public comment to be submitted in writing to the Town of Rockland Planning board and Town of Rockland Town board for further review.

Town of Rockland

Planning Board

March 3rd 2021

Page 4

Correspondence/Updates : none

Chairman Thomas Ellison made a motion to close the Planning board meeting at 9:15pm, The motion was approved by Richard Barnhart and seconded by John Veleber, Motion carried 6-0.